DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals THE CALDWELL BUILDING 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143

PETITIONER:

Employer Account No. - 2967439 TARGET SURVEYING LLC 6250 N MILITARY TRL STE 1B WEST PALM BEACH FL 33407-1407

RESPONDENT: State of Florida DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY c/o Department of Revenue

PROTEST OF LIABILITY DOCKET NO. 2012-24772R

<u>O R D E R</u>

This matter comes before me for final Department Order.

Having fully considered the Special Deputy's Recommended Order and the record of the case and in the absence of any exceptions to the Recommended Order, I adopt the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as set forth therein. A copy of the Recommended Order is attached and incorporated in this Final Order.

In consideration thereof, it is ORDERED that good cause is found to reopen the Petitioner's protest and that the determination dated January 31, 2012, is AFFIRMED.

JUDICIAL REVIEW

Any request for judicial review must be initiated within 30 days of the date the Order was filed. Judicial review is commenced by filing one copy of a *Notice of Appeal* with the DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY at the address shown at the top of this Order and a second copy, with filing fees prescribed by law, with the appropriate District Court of Appeal. It is the responsibility of the party appealing to the Court to prepare a transcript of the record. If no court reporter was at the hearing, the transcript must be prepared from a copy of the Special Deputy's hearing recording, which may be requested from the Office of Appeals.

Cualquier solicitud para revisión judicial debe ser iniciada dentro de los 30 días a partir de la fecha en que la Orden fue registrada. La revisión judicial se comienza al registrar una copia de un *Aviso de Apelación* con la Agencia para la Innovación de la Fuerza Laboral [*DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY*] en la dirección que aparece en la parte superior de este *Orden* y una segunda copia, con los honorarios de registro prescritos por la ley, con el Tribunal Distrital de Apelaciones pertinente. Es la responsabilidad de la parte apelando al tribunal la de preparar una transcripción del registro. Si en la audiencia no se encontraba ningún estenógrafo registrado en los tribunales, la transcripción debe ser preparada de una copia de la grabación de la audiencia del Delegado Especial [*Special Deputy*], la cual puede ser solicitada de la Oficina de Apelaciones.

Nenpòt demann pou yon revizyon jiridik fèt pou l kòmanse lan yon peryòd 30 jou apati de dat ke Lòd la te depoze a. Revizyon jiridik la kòmanse avèk depo yon kopi yon *Avi Dapèl* ki voye bay DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY lan nan adrès ki parèt pi wo a, lan tèt *Lòd* sa a e yon dezyèm kopi, avèk frè depo ki preskri pa lalwa, bay Kou Dapèl Distrik apwopriye a. Se responsabilite pati k ap prezante apèl la bay Tribinal la pou l prepare yon kopi dosye a. Si pa te gen yon stenograf lan seyans lan, kopi a fèt pou l prepare apati de kopi anrejistreman seyans lan ke Adjwen Spesyal la te fè a, e ke w ka mande Biwo Dapèl la voye pou ou. DONE and ORDERED at Tallahassee, Florida, this _____ day of September, 2012.



Altemese Smith, Assistant Director, Reemployment Assistance Services DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY

FILED ON THIS DATE PURSUANT TO § 120.52, FLORIDA STATUTES, WITH THE DESIGNATED DEPARTMENT CLERK, RECEIPT OF WHICH IS HEREBY ACKNOWLEDGED.

DEPUTY CLERK

DATE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that true and correct copies of the foregoing Final Order have been furnished to the persons listed below in the manner described, on the _____ day of September, 2012.

Shinese t

SHANEDRA Y. BARNES, Special Deputy Clerk DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143 By U.S. Mail:

TARGET SURVEYING LLC 6250 N MILITARY TRL STE 1B WEST PALM BEACH FL 33407-1407

DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: VANDA RAGANS - CCOC #1-4857 5050 WEST TENNESSEE STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399

MICHAEL TILLETT CPA 901 SOUTH FLAGLER DRIVE P O BOX 24708 WEST PALM BEACH FL 33416

DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: DIANNE AYERS PO BOX 6417 TALLAHASSEE FL 32314-6417

State of Florida DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY c/o Department of Revenue

DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals

MSC 347 CALDWELL BUILDING 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143

PETITIONER:

Employer Account No. - 2967439 TARGET SURVEYING LLC 6250 N MILITARY TRL STE 1B WEST PALM BEACH FL 33407-1407

PROTEST OF LIABILITY DOCKET NO. 2012-24772R

RESPONDENT: State of Florida DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY c/o Department of Revenue

RECOMMENDED ORDER OF SPECIAL DEPUTY

TO: Assistant Director, Interim Executive Director, Reemployment Assistance Services DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY

This matter comes before the undersigned Special Deputy pursuant to the Petitioner's protest of the Respondent's determination dated January 31, 2012.

After due notice to the parties, a telephone hearing was held on July 16, 2012. The Petitioner, represented by its managing member, appeared and testified. The Respondent, represented by a Department of Revenue Tax Auditor III, appeared and testified.

The record of the case, including the recording of the hearing and any exhibits submitted in evidence, is herewith transmitted. Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law were not received.

Issue:

Whether the Petitioner's tax rates were properly computed, pursuant to Section 443.131, Florida Statutes; Rules 73B-10.026; 10.031, Florida Administrative Code.

Whether the Petitioner's liability for reemployment assistance contributions was properly determined pursuant to Sections 443.1215, 1216, 1217; 443.131, Florida Statutes.

NON-APPEARANCE: Whether there is good cause for proceeding with an additional hearing, pursuant to Florida Administrative Code Rule 73B-10.035(18).

Findings of Fact:

- 1. Target Surveying Inc. is a corporation which operated a general land surveying company until June 24, 2010. The president of Target Surveying Inc. was Clyde McNeal and the vice president was Jamie Mickle. Jamie Mickle ran the day-to-day operations of Target Surveying Inc.
- 2. On May 25, 2010, Jamie Mickle formed a limited liability company, Target Surveying, LLC for the purpose of purchasing the assets of Target Surveying Inc. Jamie Mickle is the primary owner and the managing partner of Target Surveying, LLC, the Petitioner in this case.
- 3. On June 25, 2010, Target Surveying, LLC began operations as a general land surveying company. Target Surveying Inc. reported wages for forty-eight employees for the second quarter 2010. Forty-six of those employees were transferred to Target Surveying, LLC on June 25, 2010.
- 4. As a limited liability company Target Surveying, LLC did not have officers. On December 22, 2010, Target Surveying, LLC amended its Articles of Organization to include officers. At that time Clyde McNeal was named as vice president.
- 5. Target Surveying, LLC submitted an *Application to Collect and/or Report Tax in Florida* to register for the payment of unemployment compensation tax. On the Application Jamie Mickle stated that Target Surveying, LLC did not purchase the business from another entity.
- 6. Based on the information contained in the *Application to Collect and/or report Tax in Florida* the Department of Revenue assigned the initial unemployment compensation tax rate that is assigned to all new employers, .0270.
- 7. The Department of Revenue discovered that, on June 25, 2010, the workforce of Target Surveying Inc. had been transferred to Target Surveying, LLC. Further investigation revealed that Jamie Mickle was the vice president of Target Surveying Inc. and that Jamie Mickle is the managing member of Target Surveying, LLC.
- 8. By determination mailed on or before January 31, 2012, the Department of Revenue notified Target Surveying, LLC that, since it appeared that Target Surveying, LLC had acquired the workforce of Target Surveying Inc. and since there was common ownership, management, or control of the two entities, the unemployment experience attributable to Target Surveying Inc. was transferred to Target Surveying, LLC effective June 25, 2010, resulting in a tax rate of .0540. The Certified Public Accountant for Target Surveying, LLC filed a timely appeal by letter dated February 17, 2012.
- 9. Pursuant to the appeal filed by the Petitioner a telephone hearing was scheduled to be held on June 11, 2012. A *Notice of Telephone Hearing Before Special Deputy* was mailed to both the Petitioner's address of record and to the Certified Public Accountant. The Notice bears the following note "All parties are scheduled to participate by telephone. Contact the deputy clerk at once to provide the name and telephone number of the person to be contacted for the conference call hearing."
- 10. The Petitioner received the Notice and assumed that the Certified Public Accountant would handle the matter. Neither the Petitioner nor its Certified Public Accountant provided contact information for the hearing. Following the scheduled time of the hearing the Petitioner contacted the Certified Public Accountant to ask how the hearing went. The Certified Public Accountant replied that he had assumed that the Petitioner would handle the matter.
- 11. On June 11, 2010, a Recommended Order of Dismissal was mailed to all parties since the Petitioner had failed to prosecute the appeal. By letter dated June 12, 2012, the Petitioner's Certified Public Accountant requested that the appeal be reopened.

- 12. Rule 73B-10.035, Florida Administrative Code, provides:
 - (18) Request to Re-Open Proceedings. Upon written request of the Petitioner or upon the special deputy's own motion, the special deputy will for good cause rescind a Recommended Order to dismiss the case and reopen the proceedings. Upon written request of the Respondent or Joined Party, or upon the special deputy's own motion, the special deputy may for good cause rescind a Recommended Order and reopen the proceedings if the party did not appear at the most recently scheduled hearing and the special deputy entered a recommendation adverse to the party. The special deputy will have the authority to reopen an appeal under this rule provided that the request is filed or motion entered within the time limit permitted to file exceptions to the Recommended Order. A threshold issue to be decided at any hearing held to consider allowing the entry of evidence on the merits of a case will be whether good cause exists for a party's failure to attend the previous hearing. If good cause is found, the special deputy will proceed on the merits of the case. If good cause is not found, the Recommended Order will be reinstated.
- 13. Rule 73B-10.035(19)(c), Florida Administrative Code, provides that any party aggrieved by the Recommended Order may file written exceptions to the Director or the Director's designee within 15 days of the mailing date of the Recommended Order.
- 14. The Petitioner did not participate in the June 11, 2012, hearng because of a lack of communication between the Petitioner and its accountant. Thus, the Petitioner's reason for not participating in the hearing was human error. The accountant exercised due diligence by promptly requesting rehearing. Thus, good cause has been established.
- 15. Section 443.131(3), Florida Statutes, provides:
 - (g) *Transfer of unemployment experience upon transfer or acquisition of a business.*--Notwithstanding any other provision of law, upon transfer or acquisition of a business, the following conditions apply to the assignment of rates and to transfers of unemployment experience:
 - 1.a. If an employer transfers its trade or business, or a portion thereof, to another employer and, at the time of the transfer, there is any common ownership, management, or control of the two employers, the unemployment experience attributable to the transferred trade or business shall be transferred to the employer to whom the business is so transferred. The rates of both employers shall be recalculated and made effective as of the beginning of the calendar quarter immediately following the date of the transfer of the trade or business unless the transfer occurred on the first day of a calendar quarter, in which case the rate shall be recalculated as of that date.
- 16. Section 443.131(3)(g)7.b., Florida Statutes, provides that "trade or business" shall include the employer's workforce.
- 17. Rule 73B-10.031(3), Florida Administrative Code, provides in pertinent part that for the purpose of implementing Section 443.131(3)(g), F.S.:
 - (a) The term "ownership" means any proprietary interest in a business, including, but not limited to, shares of stock in a corporation, partnership interest in a partnership or membership interest in a Limited Liability Company (LLC).
 - (b) "Common ownership" exists when a person has ownership in two or more businesses.
 - (c) A person in "management" includes any officer or director of a corporation, owner of a sole proprietorship, partner in a partnership, manager of an LLC, or person with the ability to direct the activities of an employing unit, either individually or in concert with others.
 - (d) "Common management" exists when a person concurrently occupies management positions in two or more businesses.
 - (e) A person in "control" of a business includes any officer or director of a corporation, owner of a sole proprietorship, partner in a partnership, manager of an LLC, or other person with the

ability, directly or indirectly, individually or in concert with others, to influence or direct management, activities or policies of the business through ownership of stock, voting rights, contract, or other means. Control exists when an employee leasing company dictates or specifies the businesses with which a client company must contract.

- (f) "Common control" exists when a person or group of persons has control of two or more businesses.
- (g) The phrase "transfer or acquisition" encompasses any and all types of transfers and acquisitions including, but not limited to, assignments, changes in legal identity or form, consolidations, conveyances, mergers, name changes, purchase and sale agreements, reorganizations, stock transfers and successions.
- (h) The phrase "trade or business or a portion thereof" includes but is not limited to assets, customers, management, organization and workforce.
- (i) For the purpose of determining issues relating to the transfer of employment records upon transfer or acquisition of a business, the term "person" has the meaning set forth in Section 7701(a)(1) of the Internal Revenue Code.
- 18. The Petitioner purchased the assests and acquired the workforce of Target Surveying Inc. effective June 25, 2010. Jamie Mickle was vice president of Target Surveying Inc. and ran the day-to-day operations of the business. Jamie Mickle is the managing partner of Target Surveying, LLC. Thus, there was common management at the time the transfer occurred.

Recommendation: It is recommended that good cause be found to reopen the Petitioner's protest. It is recommended that the determination dated January 31, 2012, be AFFIRMED.

Respectfully submitted on August 10, 2012.



R. O. SMITH, Special Deputy Office of Appeals

A party aggrieved by the *Recommended Order* may file written exceptions to the Director at the address shown above within fifteen days of the mailing date of the *Recommended Order*. Any opposing party may file counter exceptions within ten days of the mailing of the original exceptions. A brief in opposition to counter exceptions may be filed within ten days of the mailing of the counter exceptions. Any party initiating such correspondence must send a copy of the correspondence to each party of record and indicate that copies were sent.

Una parte que se vea perjudicada por la *Orden Recomendada* puede registrar excepciones por escrito al Director Designado en la dirección que aparece arriba dentro de quince días a partir de la fecha del envío por correo de la *Orden Recomendada*. Cualquier contraparte puede registrar contra-excepciones dentro de los diez días a partir de la fecha de envió por correo de las excepciones originales. Un sumario en oposición a contra-excepciones puede ser registrado dentro de los diez días a partir de la fecha de envío por correo de las contra-excepciones. Cualquier parte que dé inicio a tal correspondencia debe enviarle una copia de tal correspondencia a cada parte contenida en el registro y señalar que copias fueron remitidas.

Yon pati ke *Lòd Rekòmande* a afekte ka prezante de eksklizyon alekri bay Direktè Adjwen an lan adrès ki parèt anlè a lan yon peryòd kenz jou apati de dat ke *Lòd Rekòmande* a te poste a. Nenpòt pati ki fè opozisyon ka prezante objeksyon a eksklizyon yo lan yon peryòd dis jou apati de lè ke objeksyon a eksklizyon orijinal yo te poste. Yon dosye ki prezante ann opozisyon a objeksyon a eksklizyon yo, ka prezante lan yon peryòd dis jou apati de dat ke

objeksyon a eksklizyon yo te poste. Nenpòt pati ki angaje yon korespondans konsa dwe voye yon kopi kourye a bay chak pati ki enplike lan dosye a e endike ke yo te voye kopi yo.

Shencen 5. 7

SHANEDRA Y. BARNES, Special Deputy Clerk

Date Mailed: August 10, 2012

Copies mailed to: Petitioner Respondent Joined Party

> DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: VANDA RAGANS - CCOC #1-4857 5050 WEST TENNESSEE STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399

MICHAEL TILLETT CPA 901 SOUTH FLAGLER DRIVE P O BOX 24708 WEST PALM BEACH FL 33416

DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: DIANNE AYERS PO BOX 6417 TALLAHASSEE FL 32314-6417