# DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals THE CALDWELL BUILDING 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143

### **PETITIONER:**

Employer Account No. - 3011926 ROMEO AVIATION, INC 6675 CORPORATE CENTER PKWY STE 100 JACKSONVILLE FL 32216-8080

**RESPONDENT:** 

State of Florida
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC
OPPORTUNITY
c/o Department of Revenue

PROTEST OF LIABILITY DOCKET NO. 2011-69493L

## ORDER

This matter comes before me for final Department Order.

Having fully considered the Special Deputy's Recommended Order and the record of the case and in the absence of any exceptions to the Recommended Order, I adopt the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as set forth therein. A copy of the Recommended Order is attached and incorporated in this Final Order.

In consideration thereof, it is ORDERED that the determination dated March 8, 2011, is REVERSED.

#### **JUDICIAL REVIEW**

Any request for judicial review must be initiated within 30 days of the date the Order was filed. Judicial review is commenced by filing one copy of a *Notice of Appeal* with the DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY at the address shown at the top of this Order and a second copy, with filing fees prescribed by law, with the appropriate District Court of Appeal. It is the responsibility of the party appealing to the Court to prepare a transcript of the record. If no court reporter was at the hearing, the transcript must be prepared from a copy of the Special Deputy's hearing recording, which may be requested from the Office of Appeals.

Cualquier solicitud para revisión judicial debe ser iniciada dentro de los 30 días a partir de la fecha en que la Orden fue registrada. La revisión judicial se comienza al registrar una copia de un *Aviso de Apelación* con la Agencia para la Innovación de la Fuerza Laboral [DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY] en la dirección que aparece en la parte superior de este *Orden* y una segunda copia, con los honorarios de registro prescritos por la ley, con el Tribunal Distrital de Apelaciones pertinente. Es la responsabilidad de la parte apelando al tribunal la de preparar una transcripción del registro. Si en la audiencia no se encontraba ningún estenógrafo registrado en los tribunales, la transcripción debe ser preparada de una copia de la grabación de la audiencia del Delegado Especial [Special Deputy], la cual puede ser solicitada de la Oficina de Apelaciones.

Nenpòt demann pou yon revizyon jiridik fèt pou l kòmanse lan yon peryòd 30 jou apati de dat ke Lòd la te depoze a. Revizyon jiridik la kòmanse avèk depo yon kopi yon *Avi Dapèl* ki voye bay DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY lan nan adrès ki parèt pi wo a, lan tèt *Lòd* sa a e yon dezyèm kopi, avèk frè depo ki preskri pa lalwa, bay Kou Dapèl Distrik apwopriye a. Se responsabilite pati k ap prezante apèl la bay Tribinal la pou l prepare yon kopi dosye a. Si pa te gen yon stenograf lan seyans lan, kopi a fèt pou l prepare apati de kopi anrejistreman seyans lan ke Adjwen Spesyal la te fè a, e ke w ka mande Biwo Dapèl la voye pou ou.

DONE and ORDERED at Tallahassee, Florida, this day of October, 2012.



Altemese Smith,
Assistant Director,
Reemployment Assistance Services
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY

FILED ON THIS DATE PURSUANT TO § 120.52, FLORIDA STATUTES, WITH THE DESIGNATED DEPARTMENT CLERK, RECEIPT OF WHICH IS HEREBY ACKNOWLEDGED.

Shinur D. Barris	
DEPUTY CLERK	DATE

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that true and correct copies of the foregoing Final Order have been furnished to the persons listed below in the manner described, on the \_\_\_\_\_ day of October, 2012.

Shenew J. Barro

SHANEDRA Y. BARNES, Special Deputy Clerk DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143 By U.S. Mail:

ROMEO AVIATION, INC 6675 CORPORATE CENTER PKWY STE 100 JACKSONVILLE FL 32216-8080

TIMOTHY WADSWORTH 1477 LINDSEY CROSSING DRIVE JACKSONVILLE FL 32218

DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: VANDA RAGANS - CCOC #1-4857 5050 WEST TENNESSEE STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399

DOR BLOCKED CLAIMS UNIT ATTENTION MYRA TAYLOR P O BOX 6417 TALLAHASSEE FL 32314-6417

GRAY ROBINSON ATTORNEY AT LAW ATTN: WILLIAM ANDREWS 50 NORTH LAURA STREET SUITE 1100 JACKSONVILLE FL 32202

State of Florida DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY c/o Department of Revenue

# DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY Reemployment Assistance Appeals

MSC 347 CALDWELL BUILDING 107 EAST MADISON STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-4143

#### **PETITIONER:**

Employer Account No. - 3011926 ROMEO AVIATION, INC 6675 CORPORATE CENTER PKWY STE 100 JACKSONVILLE FL 32216-8080

PROTEST OF LIABILITY DOCKET NO. 2011-69493L

#### **RESPONDENT:**

State of Florida
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC
OPPORTUNITY
c/o Department of Revenue

# RECOMMENDED ORDER OF SPECIAL DEPUTY

TO: Assistant Director,
Interim Executive Director,
Reemployment Assistance Services
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY

This matter comes before the undersigned Special Deputy pursuant to the Petitioner's protest of the Respondent's determination dated March 8, 2011.

After due notice to the parties, a telephone hearing was held on August 15, 2012. The Petitioner's attorney appeared at the hearing and called a shareholder as a witness. The Joined Party appeared and testified on his own behalf. A tax specialist II appeared and testified on behalf of the respondent.

The record of the case, including the recording of the hearing and any exhibits submitted in evidence, is herewith transmitted. Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law were not received.

#### **Issue:**

Whether services performed for the Petitioner by the Joined Party constitute insured employment, and if so, the effective date of liability, pursuant to Section 443.036(19), 443.036(21); 443.1216, Florida Statutes.

Whether the Petitioner meets liability requirements for Florida reemployment assistance contributions, and if so, the effective date of liability, pursuant to Sections 443.036(19); 443.036(21), Florida Statutes.

#### **Findings of Fact:**

- 1. The Petitioner is a corporation created in 2005 for the purpose of owning an aircraft and creating a liability shield.
- 2. The Joined Party provided services as a pilot and flight trainer from 2007 through 2010.
- 3. The Joined Party was allowed to work for a competitor.

Docket No. 2011-69493L 2 of 4

4. The Joined Party was an instructor for another company. The Joined Party agreed to continue training the Petitioner.

- 5. The Joined Party was a Certified Flight Instructor.
- 6. The Petitioner would contact the Joined Party to arrange time to fly. The flights arranged by the Petitioner included training as well as vacations and other travel flights. The Joined Party could refuse work.
- 7. The Joined Party determined the flight route for any given flight.

#### **Conclusions of Law:**

- 8. The issue in this case, whether services performed for the Petitioner constitute employment subject to the Florida Unemployment Compensation Law, is governed by Chapter 443, Florida Statutes. Section 443.1216(1)(a)2., Florida Statutes, provides that employment subject to the chapter includes service performed by individuals under the usual common law rules applicable in determining an employer-employee relationship.
- 9. The Supreme Court of the United States held that the term "usual common law rules" is to be used in a generic sense to mean the "standards developed by the courts through the years of adjudication." <u>United States v. W.M. Webb, Inc.</u>, 397 U.S. 179 (1970).
- 10. The Supreme Court of Florida adopted and approved the tests in <u>1 Restatement of Law</u>, Agency 2d Section 220 (1958), for use to determine if an employment relationship exists. See <u>Cantor v. Cochran</u>, 184 So.2d 173 (Fla. 1966); <u>Miami Herald Publishing Co. v. Kendall</u>, 88 So.2d 276 (Fla. 1956); <u>Magarian v. Southern Fruit Distributors</u>, 1 So.2d 858 (Fla. 1941); see also <u>Kane Furniture Corp. v. R. Miranda</u>, 506 So.2d 1061 (Fla. 2d DCA 1987).
- 11. <u>Restatement of Law</u> is a publication, prepared under the auspices of the American Law Institute, which explains the meaning of the law with regard to various court rulings. The <u>Restatement</u> sets forth a nonexclusive list of factors that are to be considered when judging whether a relationship is an employment relationship or an independent contractor relationship.
- 12. 1 Restatement of Law, Agency 2d Section 220 (1958) provides:
  - (1) A servant is a person employed to perform services for another and who, in the performance of the services, is subject to the other's control or right of control.
  - (2) The following matters of fact, among others, are to be considered:
    - (a) the extent of control which, by the agreement, the business may exercise over the details of the work;
    - (b) whether or not the one employed is engaged in a distinct occupation or business;
    - (c) the kind of occupation, with reference to whether, in the locality, the work is usually done under the direction of the employer or by a specialist without supervision;
    - (d) the skill required in the particular occupation;
    - (e) whether the employer or the worker supplies the instrumentalities, tools, and the place of work for the person doing the work;
    - (f) the length of time for which the person is employed;
    - (g) the method of payment, whether by the time or by the job;
    - (h) whether or not the work is a part of the regular business of the employer;
    - (i) whether or not the parties believe they are creating the relation of master and servant;
    - (j) whether the principal is or is not in business.

Docket No. 2011-69493L 3 of 4

13. Comments in the Restatement explain that the word "servant" does not exclusively connote manual labor, and the word "employee" has largely replaced "servant" in statutes dealing with various aspects of the working relationship between two parties. In Department of Health and Rehabilitative Services v. Department of Labor & Employment Security, 472 So.2d 1284 (Fla. 1st DCA 1985) the court confirmed that the factors listed in the Restatement are the proper factors to be considered in determining whether an employer-employee relationship exists. However, in citing La Grande v. B&L Services, Inc., 432 So.2d 1364, 1366 (Fla. 1st DCA 1983), the court acknowledged that the question of whether a person is properly classified an employee or an independent contractor often cannot be answered by reference to "hard and fast" rules, but rather must be addressed on a case-by-case basis.

14. The record reflects that the Petitioner did not exercise control over how or when the work was performed. The Petitioner would contact the Joined Party to set up flights but the Joined Party was free to refuse any flight that did not fit his schedule. There was no set schedule or hours. The Joined Party did not have a workplace he was required to report to. The relationship created between the two parties was not a master-servant relationship. A preponderance of the evidence shows that the Petitioner did not exercise sufficient control over the Joined Party as to create an employer-employee relationship.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that the determination dated March 8, 2011, be REVERSED. Respectfully submitted on September 10, 2012.



KRIS LONKANI, Special Deputy Office of Appeals

A party aggrieved by the *Recommended Order* may file written exceptions to the Director at the address shown above within fifteen days of the mailing date of the *Recommended Order*. Any opposing party may file counter exceptions within ten days of the mailing of the original exceptions. A brief in opposition to counter exceptions may be filed within ten days of the mailing of the counter exceptions. Any party initiating such correspondence must send a copy of the correspondence to each party of record and indicate that copies were sent.

Una parte que se vea perjudicada por la *Orden Recomendada* puede registrar excepciones por escrito al Director Designado en la dirección que aparece arriba dentro de quince días a partir de la fecha del envío por correo de la *Orden Recomendada*. Cualquier contraparte puede registrar contra-excepciones dentro de los diez días a partir de la fecha de envió por correo de las excepciones originales. Un sumario en oposición a contra-excepciones puede ser registrado dentro de los diez días a partir de la fecha de envío por correo de las contra-excepciones. Cualquier parte que dé inicio a tal correspondencia debe enviarle una copia de tal correspondencia a cada parte contenida en el registro y señalar que copias fueron remitidas.

Yon pati ke *Lòd Rekòmande* a afekte ka prezante de eksklizyon alekri bay Direktè Adjwen an lan adrès ki parèt anlè a lan yon peryòd kenz jou apati de dat ke *Lòd Rekòmande* a te poste a. Nenpòt pati ki fè opozisyon ka prezante objeksyon a eksklizyon yo lan yon peryòd dis jou apati de lè ke objeksyon a eksklizyon orijinal yo te poste. Yon dosye ki prezante ann opozisyon a objeksyon a eksklizyon yo, ka prezante lan yon peryòd dis jou apati de dat ke objeksyon a eksklizyon yo te poste. Nenpòt pati ki angaje yon korespondans konsa dwe voye yon kopi kourye a bay chak pati ki enplike lan dosye a e endike ke yo te voye kopi yo.

Docket No. 2011-69493L 4 of 4

Sharebra Y. Barnes, Special Deputy Clerk

Date Mailed: September 10, 2012

Copies mailed to:

Petitioner Respondent Joined Party

TIMOTHY WADSWORTH 1477 LINDSEY CROSSING DRIVE JACKSONVILLE FL 32218 DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE ATTN: VANDA RAGANS - CCOC #1-4857 5050 WEST TENNESSEE STREET TALLAHASSEE FL 32399

DOR BLOCKED CLAIMS UNIT ATTENTION MYRA TAYLOR P O BOX 6417 TALLAHASSEE FL 32314-6417

GRAY ROBINSON ATTORNEY AT LAW ATTN: WILLIAM ANDREWS 50 NORTH LAURA STREET SUITE 1100 JACKSONVILLE FL 32202